BULLETIN
OF "CAROL I" NATIONAL DEFENCE UNIVERSITY

Travel Intelligence: Enhancing Counterterrorism and National Security

Anastasios-Nikolaos KANELLOPOULOS, Ph.D. Candidate*
Dimitrios STAVROPOULOS, M.Sc.**

*Department of Business Administration, Athens University of Economics and Business, Greece
e-mail: ankanell@aueb.gr
** Department of Informatics and Telematics, Harokopio University of Athens, Greece

Abstract

In the contemporary landscape of global security challenges, addressing the intricate dynamics of Counterterrorism and National Security is paramount. This paper emphasizes the pivotal role of Travel Intelligence (TRAVINT) in enhancing Counterterrorism (CT) strategy and improving security measures.

Eventually, through a comparative analysis between theoretical frameworks and practical applications, supplemented by case studies of Hezbollah and Hamas, the study examines the significance of TRAVINT, in proactively identifying and preventing potential Terrorism and National Security.

Keywords:

In the intricate and dynamically evolving sphere of global security challenges, an imperative exists for a thorough exploration of Counterterrorism (CT) theory and practice to effectively confront the multifaceted nature of contemporary threats. This scholarly endeavor, embarks on a broad trajectory, encompassing both theoretical foundations and pragmatic applications that constitute the bedrock of efficacious CT measures. Commencing with an exhaustive review of seminal works in CT theory, it offers an emphasis on the strategic nature of terrorism and the imperative to address root causes and establishes a robust theoretical framework, providing insights into the intricate landscape of contemporary security challenges.

Effectively transitioning from theory to practice, the paper focalizes on the pivotal role of Travel Intelligence (TRAVINT) in fortifying National Security and ensuring border control measures. TRAVINT, constituting the systematic collection, analysis, and application of travel-related information, emerges as a cornerstone in contemporary CT strategies. Delving into historical developments within the European Union and the United States, where institutions such as the Europol Travel Intelligence Center and agencies like the Transportation Security Administration actively engage in the gathering of travel-related data, the paper accentuates the escalating recognition of TRAVINT's significance.

Moreover, by synthesizing theoretical insights with practical applications, this academic inquiry posits TRAVINT as a paradigm shift in the tactical and operational approaches employed to secure nations against the evolving challenges posed by contemporary terrorism. Systematically examining the interplay between theory and practice, it contributes to a holistic comprehension of CT dynamics, underscoring the imperative for adaptive and effective strategies.

Furthermore, the paper incorporates two case studies, scrutinizing the travel patterns and operational methods of Hezbollah and Hamas terrorist organizations, providing concrete insights into their activities, and offering potential strategies for leveraging travel intelligence in CT efforts.

Counterterrorism Theory and Practice

The dynamic and multifaceted nature of global security challenges demands a thorough exploration of CT theory and practice. This comprehensive review delves into the theoretical foundations that guide the development of strategic frameworks, drawing insights from seminal academic papers that have significantly contributed to the discourse.

One pivotal aspect of CT theory is the understanding of motivations driving acts of terrorism. Robert Pape's (2013) influential work, "The Strategic Logic of Suicide Terrorism" , searches through the *strategic calculations that underpin suicide*

terrorism, shedding light on the rational decision-making processes of individuals engaged in such acts. This influential piece has profoundly shaped the theoretical discourse by highlighting the strategic underpinnings of terrorism and stressing the critical need to address its root causes for effective counterterrorism measures. By meticulously dissecting the strategic calculations behind suicide terrorism, Pape's work underscores the necessity of understanding the underlying motivations driving such acts. In due course, by recognizing the complex interplay of socio-political, economic, and ideological factors contributing to radicalization and extremist violence, Pape's insights advocate for holistic approaches aimed at mitigating these underlying grievances and conditions.

Expanding on the sociological aspects, the work of Mark S. Hamm and Ramón Spaaij (2017) in "The Age of Lone Wolf Terrorism" provides valuable insights into the phenomenon of *lone-wolf attacks*. Understanding the motivations, radicalization processes, and unique challenges posed by individuals acting alone adds a layer of complexity to CT Theory, necessitating adaptive strategies in practice.

Moreover, theoretical frameworks must also encompass a broader perspective that considers the psychological dimensions of *radicalization*. "Radicalization in the West: The Homegrown Threat" by Mitchell D. Silber and Arvin Bhatt (2007) is an influential work that explores the various factors contributing to radicalization, emphasizing the need for a multidisciplinary approach. As the theoretical foundation informs practical measures, intelligence agencies play a pivotal role in gathering and analyzing information critical to identifying potential threats. J. M. Berger's (2015) research on "The ISIS Twitter Census" underscores the significance of *technological advancements in intelligence gathering*, particularly the role of social media in the dissemination of extremist ideologies. This work highlights the need for CT practitioners to remain technologically savvy and adapt their strategies to the evolving online landscape.

In addition, the practical application of intelligence, however, comes with ethical considerations. Issues of surveillance, privacy rights, and data protection are explored in Didier Bigo's (2008) work, "Security, Exception, Ban and Surveillance: A Critical Sociology of the War on Terror". Bigo's examination of the ethical challenges associated with CT practices calls for an extensive approach that balances security imperatives with respect for individual rights.

Summing up, this academic inquiry into CT theory and practice underscores the importance of integrating insights from various disciplines. Important works ranging from strategic analyses of terrorism to sociological and psychological examinations of radicalization contribute to a holistic understanding. The symbiotic relationship between theory and practice remains crucial, with academic research informing the development of adaptive and effective CT strategies that address the complexities of the contemporary security landscape (Shepherd 2022).

Defining Travel Intelligence

The role of Travel Intelligence (TRAVINT) in bolstering national security and ensuring effective border control is instrumental, offering valuable insights into potential threats, risks, and suspicious activities tied to individuals and materials in transition. TRAVINT involves the systematic collection, analysis, and utilization of travel-related information and intelligence, enhancing security measures and law enforcement efforts. Focusing on data generated by passenger travel, including Passenger Name Record (PNR), Advance Passenger Information (API), and the European Travel Information and Authorization System (ETIAS), TRAVINT serves as a cornerstone in contemporary CT strategies (National Counterterrorism Center 2013; European Parliament 2016; Romanian Parliament 2019; Priestley and Beauvais 2022; Wagner 2021; Namazov 2022; Frizberg 2023).

The historical trajectory of TRAVINT in the European Union (EU) and the United States reflects a growing recognition of the need for enhanced security measures. In the EU, the establishment of the Europol Travel Intelligence Center (ETIC) in 2019, as part of Europol's horizontal operational services, signifies a concerted effort to utilize travel-related data in combating security threats within the EU (Frontex, 2020; Romanian Parliament, 2019). This development aligns with the EU's commitment to collecting and sharing travel data, as outlined in the EU PNR directive 2016/681 (Priestley and Beauvais, 2022). Similarly, in the United States, organizations like the Transportation Security Administration (TSA) and the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) actively gather travel-related data for security and border protection purposes, recognizing the pivotal role of TRAVINT in national and regional security strategies. (National Counterterrorism Center 2013; US Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office 2015, 2017).

Eventually, TRAVINT aids in the identification of individuals or groups posing a threat to national security by monitoring travel patterns and analyzing passenger data (National Counterterrorism Center 2013). It also provides insights for assessing potential risks associated with destinations, travel routes, or transportation modes, allowing authorities to determine the appropriate level of security measures required (US Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office 2015). In responding to emerging threats, TRAVINT enables authorities to adjust their security strategies promptly by continuously monitoring and analyzing travel-related information (National Counterterrorism Center 2013). Moreover, it facilitates watchlist management, helping border security agencies identify and screen individuals who pose security risks (US Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office 2015, 2017).

Specifically referring to Passenger Name Record (PNR), it is a comprehensive record containing information about a passenger's travel arrangements. PNR data, collected by airlines and travel agencies during the booking process, includes details such as the passenger's name, contact information, travel itinerary, ticket information, seat

assignments, and other relevant data (Glouftsios and Leese 2022). The analysis and use of PNR data for intelligence and security purposes within the framework of TRAVINT involve detecting anomalies or red flags indicating suspicious or illicit activity, such as travel to high-risk destinations or patterns warranting further investigation (Namazov 2022).

Subsequently, despite the critical role of PNR in TRAVINT, the collection and use of PNR data for intelligence purposes necessitate adherence to legal and regulatory frameworks, considering potential privacy implications (De Hert and Papakonstantinou 2010). Nevertheless, the analysis of PNR data within the TRAVINT context contributes significantly to enhancing security, preventing terrorism, combating human trafficking, and supporting law enforcement efforts (Rudner 2014; Barnea 2019; Shepherd 2022).

Discussion over Travel Intelligence Use in Counterterrorism Efforts

CT is inherently concerned with thwarting the activities of terrorist actors and organizations, and it involves, among other actions, intelligence gathering, analysis, and the implementation of measures to prevent acts of terrorism. This includes activities such as monitoring travel patterns, conducting background checks, and analyzing passenger data, all crucial components in identifying individuals with connections to terrorism (National Counterterrorism Center 2013; US Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office 2015, 2017).

In due course, TRAVINT emerges as a linchpin in the complex and dynamic landscape of CT, offering a sophisticated and multifaceted approach that combines tactical and operational methodologies. At the tactical level, the strategic utilization of Pattern Intelligence Analysis proves indispensable. This involves a meticulous analysis of Passenger Name Record (PNR) data, allowing the identification of anomalies or suspicious activities that may indicate potential security risks. The scrutiny extends to the examination of unusual travel itineraries, frequent changes in travel plans, and connections to known terrorism organizations' hotspots (European Commission 2023; Frontex 2020, 1–10). This comprehensive approach to pattern analysis not only aids in threat detection but also provides granular insights into the modus operandi of potential threats (Shepherd 2022).

Thereafter, complementing Pattern Intelligence Analysis, Social Network Analysis adds depth to the tactical arsenal by conducting link analysis on PNR data. This methodology unveils connections between individuals or groups engaged in terrorism activities. By dissecting shared travel patterns, common contacts, and other indicators of collaboration, Social Network Analysis contributes to a comprehensive understanding of the collaborative efforts within the terrorist network

(Shulsky and Schmitt 2009, 11–18). This strategic approach transcends individual analysis, delving into the interconnectivity that defines modern terrorism and allows for a more targeted and effective response (Shepherd 2022).

Moreover, Travel Behavioral Analysis represents another critical component of the tactical repertoire within travel intelligence. Examining the behavior of individuals or groups in PNR data provides unique insights into potential terrorism activities. This behavioral scrutiny encompasses an analysis of social behaviors, travel patterns, unusual booking behavior, and other indicators of suspicious activity (European Commission 2023; Frontex 2020, 1–10). By understanding the behavioral nuances embedded in travel data, law enforcement agencies can refine their threat assessments and proactively identify potential risks (Shepherd 2022).

On the operational front, TRAVINT unfolds as a comprehensive and adaptive strategy that extends beyond analysis to continuous monitoring and assessment. The integration of PNR data with other intelligence sources becomes imperative for a more holistic CT strategy. By merging PNR data with diverse intelligence sources, such as open-source intelligence (OSINT) and human intelligence (HUMINT), law enforcement agencies gain a more comprehensive and contextualized picture of potential terrorist activities. This collaborative approach not only corroborates findings but also provides additional context, ensuring a robust and validated understanding of potential threats (European Commission 2023; Frontex 2020, 1–10).

The implementation of these tactical and operational approaches necessitates a strategic policy framework that fosters collaboration, investment in advanced technologies, and a balance between security imperatives and individual privacy rights. International collaboration is paramount, with the establishment of robust information-sharing mechanisms globally and the fostering of bilateral agreements and joint task forces for intelligence exchange. Standardizing protocols ensures coordinated responses to emerging threats on a global scale. Investing in advanced data analytics and artificial intelligence capabilities enhances the tactical approach, enabling accurate pattern recognition and anomaly detection in travel data. Real-time monitoring requires substantial technological investments, but the benefits of early threat detection and response make it a worthwhile endeavor. Additionally, adopting a risk-based approach to CT ensures that resources are allocated efficiently, focusing efforts on high-risk travelers without causing undue disruptions (Government Publishing Office 2011).

Summarizing, TRAVINT represents a paradigm shift in the tactical and operational approaches employed in CT efforts. From pattern analysis and social network scrutiny to comprehensive operational strategies involving the integration of various intelligence sources and real-time monitoring, travel intelligence offers a multi-faceted approach to identifying and countering security threats. By embracing these approaches and implementing the suggested policy proposals, nations can foster a

more secure and resilient global landscape, proactively addressing the challenges posed by contemporary terrorism (Shepherd 2022).

Case Studies

The Case of Hezbollah

Hezbollah, a Shiite Islamist organization with a global footprint, poses a distinctive challenge in monitoring the travel patterns and *modus operandi* of its members. This case study explores wide scenarios, and travel intelligence considerations imperative for comprehending and countering Hezbollah's activities on a global scale.

Hezbollah's modus operandi is a multifaceted amalgamation of covert operations, guerrilla tactics, and recruitment strategies. Searching through the intricacies of their methods is paramount for devising effective CT strategies.

- Exploiting Lebanon and Syria International Diaspora: Hezbollah strategically capitalizes on the international diaspora originating from Lebanon and Syria, particularly in regions such as the European Union, South America, and Canada. The organization adeptly taps into these diaspora networks to gain support by engaging in fundraising activities, and potentially recruiting sympathizers. The utilization of diaspora communities provides Hezbollah with a global reach, enabling the establishment of transnational connections and alliances. Understanding the dynamics of Hezbollah's engagement with its international diaspora, especially in regions with significant Lebanese and Syrian communities, is pivotal for developing comprehensive CT strategies that address this facet of their modus operandi (Haddad 2005; Levitt 2015; Avon et al. 2012; Dionigi 2015; Kızılkaya 2019).

- Employing Coordinated Networks: Hezbollah members operate within highly coordinated networks, relying on encrypted communication channels to communicate and execute plans clandestinely. This interconnected web enhances their ability to avoid detection and facilitates seamless coordination on a global scale. The establishment of coordinated networks underscores Hezbollah's organizational sophistication. By leveraging encrypted communication, they create a resilient infrastructure that adapts to the challenges posed by modern CT measures, emphasizing the need for law enforcement agencies to stay ahead in the technological arms race (Avon et al. 2012; Dionigi 2015; Levitt 2015; Koss 2018; Kızılkaya 2019).

- Harnessing Legitimate Businesses: A distinctive facet of Hezbollah's approach involves exploiting legitimate businesses to finance their activities. This tactic blurs the lines between legal and illicit transactions, making it intricate for authorities to discern between routine economic engagements and those that fund the organization's operations. Hezbollah's incorporation of legitimate

businesses into its funding model showcases a shrewd understanding of financial systems. This dual-use strategy not only provides a stream of resources but also complicates efforts to trace and block financial support, demanding an extensive and adaptive approach from CT authorities (Levitt 2015; Avon et al. 2012; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018; Kızılkaya 2019).

• Radicalization and Recruitment: The organization engages in systematic radicalization and recruitment efforts, often targeting diaspora communities. Identifying the patterns within these communities is pivotal for preemptive action against potential threats and serves as a key element in disrupting Hezbollah's operational capabilities. The emphasis on radicalization and recruitment within diaspora communities highlights Hezbollah's efforts to exploit existing social structures. Understanding and countering these patterns are essential not only for preventing the recruitment of new members but also for dismantling existing networks and mitigating the organization's global influence (Levitt 2015; Avon et al. 2012; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018; Kızılkaya 2019).

The Case of Hamas

Hamas, recognized as a terrorist organization by numerous countries, operates within a multifaceted environment shaped by political, religious, and socio-economic factors. Comprehensive knowledge of the travel patterns and operational methods of Hamas members is imperative for developing effective CT strategies. This case study aims to scrutinize these aspects and propose potential strategies for leveraging travel intelligence in CT efforts.

Hamas's operational methodology, much like Hezbollah's, comprises the same diverse combination of operational tactics and strategies. A comprehensive examination of the intricate details of these methods is essential for the formulation of effective CT strategies. Understanding the nuances of Hamas's modus operandi is crucial to developing informed and targeted approaches to mitigate the organization's activities.

• Using International Palestine Migrants and Minorities: Hamas strategically leverages international Palestinian migrants and sympathizers residing in regions such as the European Union, Canada, and the United States. By exploiting existing diaspora communities, the organization seeks to establish support networks, facilitate recruitment, and potentially utilize these connections for international operations. Understanding the dynamics of engagement with Palestine migrants and minorities in these regions is crucial for comprehending the global reach of Hamas and devising CT strategies that address this aspect of their modus operandi (Shadid 1988; Dunning 2015; Sen 2015; Flamer 2022).

• Manning Covert Operations: Hamas employs covert operations, deploying clandestine networks for recruitment, fundraising, and communication. Members adeptly navigate beneath the radar, exploiting vulnerabilities in border

control systems and employing clandestine channels to move undetected and avoid surveillance (Shadid 1988; Uslu and Karatas 2020).

- Exploiting Social and Cultural Ties: Hamas members leverage extensively the social and cultural ties within the Palestinian territories. This involves exploiting familial connections, community relationships, and shared ideologies to facilitate recruitment and movement. The intertwining of social and cultural networks serves as a foundation for the organization's resilience and operational effectiveness (Shadid 1988; Dunning 2015; Sen 2015; Flamer 2022).

- Financial Networks: Hamas strategically employs financial networks, often relying on illicit funding sources to support its operations. This includes money laundering, exploitation of informal financial systems, and clandestine transactions that contribute to the organization's financial resilience (Shadid 1988; Berti 2015; Uslu and Karatas 2020; Alsoos 2021).

Hezbollah and Hamas members' Travel Patterns

Hezbollah and Hamas's members exhibit a remarkable ability to conceal their movements, employing a mix of legal and illicit means for international travel. The potential travel patterns encompass a spectrum of strategies.

- Disguised Tourism: Members adeptly disguise their activities as ordinary tourists, leveraging legitimate travel documents to seamlessly blend in with the regular flow of travelers. This tactic enables them to operate discreetly while avoiding unnecessary attention from authorities. The skillful use of disguised tourism by Hezbollah and Hamas members highlights the adaptability and resourcefulness of the organizations. By seamlessly integrating into crowds of genuine tourists, they exploit the anonymity that travel affords, complicating efforts to identify and track their movements (Dionigi 2015; Uslu and Karatas 2020).

- Business Cover: Hezbollah and Hamas operatives frequently utilize business-related travel as a cover for their activities. Engaging in seemingly legitimate ventures, these members manage to mask their true objectives behind a façade of routine business dealings, making it challenging for authorities to discern their clandestine motives. The adoption of business cover demonstrates Hezbollah and Hamas's strategic thinking, utilizing the guise of legitimate enterprises to shield their true intentions. This approach not only provides operational cover but also adds an additional layer of complexity for law enforcement agencies attempting to distinguish between lawful business activities and potential threats (Shadid 1988; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018; Flamer 2022).

- Multiple Transit Points: Hezbollah and Hamas members employ sophisticated travel itineraries with multiple transit points. This deliberate complexity serves to obfuscate their final destinations and the overarching purpose of their travels, adding an extra

layer of intricacy to efforts aimed at deciphering their global movements. By weaving intricate travel routes, members exploit the vastness of international travel networks, making it arduous for law enforcement agencies to pinpoint their ultimate objectives and connections (Shadid 1988; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018).

- Regional Mobility: Hamas members display significant regional mobility, frequently traversing the Palestinian territories, encompassing the Gaza Strip and West Bank. Additionally, some members may embark on cross-border journeys to countries like Egypt and Jordan. Understanding these regional movements is vital for monitoring and disrupting the organization's activities (Shadid 1988; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018; Kızılkaya 2019; Flamer 2022).

- International Connections: While Hamas primarily operates within the Palestinian territories, its members may establish connections with sympathetic entities abroad. Travel to nations like Iran, Turkey, or other regions supportive of their cause may transpire, leading to the formation of alliances and the acquisition of external support. Similarly, Hezbollah members, primarily operating within Lebanese territories, are known to establish connections with sympathetic entities abroad, engaging in travel to nations such as Iran, Syria, or other regions that align with their cause. This international outreach facilitates the formation of alliances and provides external support, contributing to the organization's resilience and operational capabilities. The connections established beyond Lebanese borders underscore Hezbollah's transnational influence and highlight the importance of monitoring these international ties for effective CT efforts (Shadid 1988; Dionigi 2015; Koss 2018; Flamer 2022).

CT Measures Utilizing TRAVINT Against Hezbollah and Hamas
In the ever-evolving landscape of CT, the need for sophisticated strategies to combat organizations like Hezbollah and Hamas is paramount. A key aspect of such an approach involves leveraging TRAVINT to monitor and thwart the movements of Hezbollah and Hamas members. Specifically:

- API and PNR Analysis: To effectively counter the travel patterns of Hezbollah and Hamas members, governments and law enforcement agencies can employ Advanced Passenger Information (API) and Passenger Name Record (PNR) analysis. By collecting and scrutinizing data related to individuals' travel details, authorities can identify suspicious patterns and connections to known members of these organizations. This method provides a proactive means of preventing potential threats before they materialize by flagging individuals associated with Hezbollah or Hamas attempting to cross borders (Frontex 2020; European Commission 2023).

- Technological Surveillance: Incorporating advanced technologies into CT measures is essential for monitoring the travel of Hezbollah and Hamas

members. Facial recognition, biometric scanning, and sophisticated surveillance systems at border crossings and airports play a pivotal role in enhancing travel intelligence. These tools can aid in the identification of individuals associated with Hezbollah and Hamas, helping security forces detect irregular travel patterns and strengthening overall security measures (Government Publishing Office 2011; Oliveira Martins et al. 2022, 10-14).

- Infiltration of Clandestine Networks: Penetrating the clandestine networks utilized by Hezbollah and Hamas is a challenging but effective CT strategy. Law enforcement agencies can deploy agents with specialized training to infiltrate these networks, gathering critical information on travel routes, safe houses, and communication channels. Such on-the-ground intelligence provides actionable insights, enabling authorities to disrupt the logistical and operational foundations of these organizations (Shulsky and Schmitt 2009; Government Publishing Office 2011; Frontex 2020; European Commission 2023).

- Continuous Risk Assessment: Maintaining a dynamic and continuously evolving risk assessment system is crucial for adapting CT measures to the changing tactics of Hezbollah and Hamas. Regularly updating watchlists, refining intelligence-sharing protocols, and incorporating emerging technologies ensure that CT efforts remain effective and responsive to the evolving strategies of these designated terrorist organizations (Frontex 2012a, 2012b, 2013; Liu et al. 2018).

- International Collaboration: Given the transnational nature of Hezbollah and Hamas, collaboration with international partners is critical. Countries facing the threat of these organizations must share information on watchlists, known associates, and travel histories. This collaborative effort enables a more comprehensive tracking of the movements of Hezbollah and Hamas members across borders. The exchange of intelligence on a global scale contributes to a more robust defense against the international activities of these groups (U.S. Government Publishing Office 2011; Frontex 2012a, 2012b, 2013; Priestley and Beauvais 2022).

Conclusions

In conclusion, this research paper underscored the paramount importance of understanding Counterterrorism Theory and its practical applications in navigating the complexities of contemporary security challenges. With a focus on Travel Intelligence (TRAVINT), the paper highlighted its pivotal role in fortifying National Security and improving border control measures. The incorporation of two sets of results from the case studies on Hezbollah and Hamas offered concrete insights into the operational and traveling methods of these terrorist organizations, contributing

to a wider comprehension of Counterterrorism dynamics. This comprehensive inquiry advocates for adaptive and effective strategies, emphasizing the symbiotic relationship between theory and practice in the ongoing efforts to secure nations against the evolving challenges posed by contemporary terrorism. Eventually, leveraging Travel Intelligence (TRAVINT) becomes essential, employing new intelligence inputs, such as Advanced Passenger Information (API) and Passenger Name Record (PNR), and new analytical approaches like Security Risk Analysis and Backlisting. This approach enables governments and law enforcement agencies, to proactively identify and prevent potential threats by scrutinizing travel patterns and connections to known members of these organizations.

References

Alsoos, I. 2021. "From jihad to resistance: The evolution of Hamas's discourse in the framework of Mobilization". *Middle Eastern Studies*, 57(5): 833–856. https://doi.org/10.1080/00263206.2021.1897006.

Avon, D., Khatchadourian, A.T. and Todd, J. M. 2012. Hezbollah: A history of the "party of god", Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Barnea, A. 2019. "Big Data and counterintelligence in western countries". *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence*, 32(3): 433–447. https://doi:10.1080/08850607.2019.1605804.

Berger, J.M. and Morgan J. 2015. "The ISIS Twitter Census", The Brookings Project on U.S. Relations with the Islamic World, no.20.

Berti, B. 2015. "Non-state actors as providers of governance: The Hamas government in Gaza between effective sovereignty, centralized authority, and resistance". *The Middle East Journal*, 69(1): 9–31. https://doi.org/10.3751/69.1.11.

De Hert, P. and Papakonstantinou, V. 2010. "The EU PNR framework decision proposal: Towards completion of the PNR processing scene in Europe", *Computer Law &; Security Review*, 26(4): 368–376. https://doi:10.1016/j.clsr.2010.05.008.

Didier, Bigo. 2006. "Security, Exception, Ban and Surveillance." *King's College London - War Studies*.

Dionigi, F. 2015. *Hezbollah, Islamist Politics, and International Society*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Dunning, T. 2015. "Islam and resistance: Hamas, ideology and Islamic values in Palestine". *Critical Studies on Terrorism*, 8(2): 284–305. https://doi.org/10.1080/17539153.2015.1042304.

European Commission. 2023. Passenger name record (PNR). https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/policies/law-enforcement-cooperation/passenger-data_en.

European Parliament. 2016. *Regulation establishing a European Travel Information and Authorisation System (ETIAS) and amending Regulations (EU) No 515/2014, (EU) 2016/399, (EU) 2016/794 and (EU) 2016/1624.*

Flamer, N. 2022. "Hezbollah and Hamas's main platforms for recruiting and handling of human sources after 2006". *Middle Eastern Studies*, 59(5): 842–854. https://doi.org/10.1080/00263206.2022.2126835.

Frizberg, D. 2023. Advance passenger information (API): Revising the rules, European Parliament. https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document/EPRS_BRI(2023)747429.

Frontex. 2012a. *Common Integrated Risk Analysis Model a comprehensive update*. Warsaw.

__. 2012b. *Guidelines for risk analysis units: Structure and tools for the application of CIRAM version 2.0*. Warsaw.

__. 2013. *Border Control in the Information Age*. https://frontex.europa.eu/media-centre/news/focus/border-control-in-the-information-age-udh57L.

__. 2020. Future Group on Travel Intelligence and Border Management. https://www.europol.europa.eu/publications-events/publications/future-group-travel-intelligence-and-border-management#downloads.

Glouftsios, G. and Leese, M. 2022. "Epistemic fusion: Passenger information units and the making of international security", *Review of International Studies*, 49(1): 125–142. https://doi:10.1017/s0260210522000365.

Haddad, S. 2005. "A survey of Lebanese Shi'i attitudes towards Hezbollah," *Small Wars & Insurgencies*, 16(3): 317–333. https://doi:10.1080/09592310500221286.

Hamm, M. and Spaaij, R. 2017. "Introduction: The age of Lone Wolf terrorism", *The Age of Lone Wolf Terrorism*. https://doi:10.7312/hamm18174-002.

Kızılkaya, Z. 2019. "Morality of Hezbollah's conflicts with Israel," *Critical Studies on Terrorism*, 12(3). https://doi:10.1080/17539153.2019.1573037.

Koss, M. 2018. "The Lebanese Hezbollah," *Resistance, Power, and Conceptions of Political Order in Islamist Organizations*. https://doi:10.4324/9781315104867-3.

Levitt, M. 2015. *Hezbollah the global footprint of Lebanon's party of god*, Washington: Georgetown University Press.

Liu, X., Portney, K. E., Mumpower, J. L. and Vedlitz, A. 2018. "Terrorism risk assessment, recollection bias, and public support for counterterrorism policy and spending". *Risk Analysis*, 39(3): 553–570. https://doi.org/10.1111/risa.13203.

Namazov, R. 2022. Application of Advance Passenger Information (API) and Passenger Name Record (PNR) security systems by using travel information. State Customs Committee of Azerbaijan and Kanazawa University of Japan. https://www.border-security-report.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/API-PNR-Namazov-research.pdf.

National Counterterrorism Center. 2013. Watch listing Guidance. https://www.eff.org/files/2014/07/24/2013-watchlist-guidance_1.pdf.

Oliveira Martins, B., Lidén, K. and Jumbert, M.G. 2022. 'Border Security and the digitalisation of sovereignty: Insights from EU Borderwork', *European Security*, 31(3): 475–494. https://doi.org/doi:10.1080/09662839.2022.2101884.

Pape, R. 2013. "The strategic logic of suicide terrorism", *Terrorism Studies*, 282–310. https://doi:10.4324/9780203717622-29.

Priestley, A. and Beauvais, M. 2022. "*International experience and good practices in API/ PNR, OSCE*". https://www.osce.org/project-coordinator-in-ukraine/510575.

Romanian Parliament. 2019. *IPEX | the Platform for EU Interparliamentary Exchange.* https://secure.ipex.eu/IPEXL-WEB/download/file/082dbcc568e94e7e0168eba504 6a0223. https://ipexl.secure.europarl.europa.eu/IPEXL-WEB/

Rudner, M. 2014. "Intelligence-led air transport security: Pre-screening for watch-lists, no-fly lists to forestall terrorist threats", *International Journal of Intelligence and CounterIntelligence*, 28(1): 38–63. doi:10.1080/08850607.2014.962352.

Sen, S. 2015. Bringing back the Palestinian state: Hamas between government and resistance. *Middle East Critique*, 24(2): 211–225. https://doi.org/10.1080/19436149.2015.1017969.

Shadid, M. K. 1988. "The Muslim Brotherhood movement in the West Bank and Gaza". *Third World Quarterly*, 10(2): 658–682. https://doi.org/10.1080/01436598808420076.

Shepherd, A.J.K. 2022. "EU counterterrorism, collective securitization, and the internal-external security nexus", *Collective Securitization and Crisification of EU Policy Change*, 117–133. https://doi.org/doi:10.4324/9781003291374-8.

Shulsky, A.N. and Schmitt, G.J. 2009. *Silent warfare: Understanding the world of Intelligence.* Washington: Potomac Books, Inc.

Silber, Mitchell, and Arvin Bhatt. 2007. *Radicalization in the west: The homegrown threat.* New York, NY: NY Police Dept.

U.S. Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office. 2015. A Report on the Use and Transfer of Passenger Name Records between the European Union and the United States. U.S. Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office.

__. 2017. Privacy Impact Assessment Update for the Automated Targeting System DHS/ CBP/PIA-006(e). U.S. Department of Homeland Security Privacy Office.

U.S. Government Publishing Office. 2011. Intelligence sharing and terrorist travel: How DHS addresses the mission of providing security, facilitating commerce, and protecting privacy for passengers engaged in International Travel. https://www. govinfo.gov/content/pkg/CHRG-112hhrg73736/html/CHRG-112hhrg73736.htm.

Uslu, N. and Karatas, I. 2020. Evaluating Hamas' struggle in Palestine. *Insight Turkey*, 109–124. https://doi.org/10.25253/99.2020221.08.

Wagner, J. 2021. *Border Management in transformation: Transnational threats and security policies of European states*. Springer.